

1 ROHIT D. NATH (316062)
2 HALLEY W. JOSEPHS (338391)
3 ELLIE R. DUPLER (337607)
4 **SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.**
5 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400
6 Los Angeles, CA 90067-6029
7 rmath@susmangodfrey.com
8 hjosephs@susmangodfrey.com
9 edupler@susmangodfrey.com
10 Telephone: (310) 789-3100
11 Facsimile: (310) 789-3150

CASSIDY BENNETT (347811)
JONATHAN JAGER (318325)
LEGAL AID FOUNDATION OF LOS ANGELES
7000 South Broadway
Los Angeles, CA 90003
cbennett@lafla.org
jjager@lafla.org
Telephone: (213) 640-3835
Facsimile: (213) 640-3988

7 GIGI LAM (284233)
8 NICHOLAS LAMPROS (299618)
9 MATTHEW A. CALCANAS (341109)
10 **BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES**
11 3250 Wilshire Boulevard, 13th Floor
12 Los Angeles, CA 90010
13 glam@bettzedek.org
14 nlampros@bettzedek.org
15 mcalcanas@bettzedek.org
16 Telephone: (323) 939-0506
17 Facsimile: (213) 471-4568

STEPHANO MEDINA (333506)
FAIZAH MALIK (320479)
ALISA RANDELL (293490)
KATHRYN EIDMANN (268053)
PUBLIC COUNSEL
610 South Ardmore Avenue
Los Angeles, CA 90005
smedina@publiccounsel.org
fmalik@publiccounsel.org
arandell@publiccounsel.org
keidmann@publiccounsel.org
Telephone: (213) 385-2977
Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

14 *Attorneys for Intervenors*
15 COMMUNITY POWER COLLECTIVE and
16 INNERCITY STRUGGLE

17 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
18 **COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES**

19 APARTMENT ASSOCIATION OF LOS
20 ANGELES COUNTY, INC. (DBA
21 APARTMENT ASSOCIATION OF
22 GREATER LOS ANGELES,

23 Petitioner and Plaintiff,
24 vs.

25 CITY OF LOS ANGELES; COUNCIL OF
26 THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES AND
27 DOES 1 TO 100, INCLUSIVE;

28 Defendants and Respondents.

Case No. 23STCP00720

Assigned For All Purposes To:
Honorable Mitchell L. Beckloff
Department 86

**STIPULATION OF THE PARTIES TO
INTERVENTION AND [PROPOSED
ORDER]**

Complaint Filed: March 3, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

The parties hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

WHEREAS, this case challenges Ordinance No. 187763 and Ordinance No. 187764 (“Ordinances”), adopted by the Los Angeles City Council; and

WHEREAS, Petitioner herein has challenged the validity of the Ordinances on the ground that the Ordinances are preempted by State law; and

WHEREAS, Community Power Collective (“CPC”) and InnerCity Struggle (“ICS”) (collectively, “Intervenors”) are community-based organizations who represent the interests of thousands of low-income tenants, who Intervenors allege will be negatively impacted in terms of health and access to housing should the Ordinances be invalidated; and

WHEREAS, Intervenors were supporters of the Ordinances, and wish to intervene in this action in defense of the Ordinances; and

WHEREAS, the existing parties are amenable thereto subject to the conditions contained herein;

NOW, THEREFORE, THE PARTIES DO STIPULATE BY AND THROUGH THEIR RESPECTIVE COUNSEL AS FOLLOWS:

1. Intervenors shall be allowed to intervene as defendants in this action.
2. In consideration of Petitioner’s agreement to this stipulation, Intervenors and Petitioner agree that neither Petitioner nor Intervenors will seek attorneys’ fees against the other.

Dated: April 18, 2023


ROHIT D. NATH
HALLEY W. JOSEPHS
ELLIE R. DUPLER
SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.

GIGI LAM
MATTHEW CALCANAS
JEFFREY WEBB
NICHOLAS LAMPROS
BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES

CASSIDY BENNETT
JONATHAN JAGER
LEGAL AID FOUNDATION OF LOS ANGELES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

STEPHANO MEDINA
FAIZAH MALIK
ALISA RANDELL
KATHRYN EIDMANN
PUBLIC COUNSEL

By: 
Ellie R. Dupler

Attorneys for Intervenors
**COMMUNITY POWER COLLECTIVE and
INNERCITY STRUGGLE**

Dated:


DOUGLAS J. DENNINGTON
PETER J. HOWELL
AMBER LES
ERIK LEGGIO
RUTAN & TUCKER, LLP
18575 Jamboree Road, 9th Floor
Irvine, CA 92612
Telephone: 714-641-5100 Facsimile: 714-546-9035

By: /s/ 

Attorneys for Petitioner/Plaintiff
APARTMENT ASSOCIATION OF GREATER LOS
ANGELES COUNTY, INC. dba APARTMENT
ASSOCIATION OF GREATER LOS ANGELES

Dated: April 18, 2023

HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO
ELAINE ZHONG
MEI-MEI CHENG
**OFFICE OF THE LOS ANGELES CITY
ATTORNEY**

By: /s/ 

Attorneys for Respondents/Defendants CITY OF LOS
ANGELES; COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF LOS
ANGELES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

[PROPOSED] ORDER

Pursuant to the stipulation of the parties, CPC and ICS are hereby permitted to intervene as defendants in this action on the terms specified in the parties' stipulation.

DATED:

Honorable Mitchell L. Beckloff

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare:

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action; my business address is 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400, Los Angeles, California 90067-6029.

On April 18, 2023, I served the foregoing document(s) described as follows:

STIPULATION OF THE PARTIES TO INTERVENTION AND [PROPOSED ORDER]

on the interested parties in this action by placing true copies thereof enclosed in sealed envelopes addressed as stated on the attached service list, as follows:

SEE ATTACHED SERVICE LIST

BY MAIL: I am “readily familiar” with the firm’s practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing. Under that practice, it would be deposited with the U.S. Postal Service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at Los Angeles, California in the ordinary course of business. I am aware that on motion of the party served, service is presumed invalid if postal cancellation date or postage meter date is more than one day after date of deposit for mailing in affidavit.

BY PERSONAL SERVICE:
I caused to be delivered such envelope by hand to the offices of the addressee.

BY FEDERAL EXPRESS OR OVERNIGHT COURIER

BY ELECTRONIC MAIL
I caused said documents to be prepared in portable document format (PDF) for e-mailing and uploading the document listed above to the Court’s Electronic Filing Service Provider (First Legal <https://www.firstlegal.com/or> One Legal <https://www.onelegal.com/>) for e-service to the email address(es) set forth on the attached service list. To my knowledge, the e-service was reported as complete and without error. See Cal. R. Ct. R. 2.251 and CCP § 1010.6.

Executed on April 18, 2023, Los Angeles, California.

(State) I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct.

Jerod Williams
Typed Name

/s/ Jerod Williams
Signature

SERVICE LIST

1
2 GIGI LAM
3 MATTHEW CALCANAS
4 JEFFREY WEBB
5 NICHOLAS LAMPROS
6 **BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES**
7 3250 Wilshire Boulevard, 13th Floor
8 Los Angeles, CA 90010
9 Telephone: (323) 648-4706
10 Facsimile: (213) 471-4568
11 glam@bettzedek.org
12 mcalcanas@bettzedek.org
13 jwebb@bettzedek.org
14 nlampros@bettzedek.org
15 *Attorneys for Intervenors*
16 **COMMUNITY POWER COLLECTIVE**
17 **and INNERCITY STRUGGLE**

18
19 STEPHANO MEDINA
20 FAIZAH MALIK
21 ALISA RANDELL
22 KATHRYN EIDMANN
23 **PUBLIC COUNSEL**
24 610 South Ardmere Avenue
25 Los Angeles, CA 90005
26 Telephone: (213) 385-2977
27 Facsimile: (213) 385-9089
28 smedina@publiccounsel.org
keidmann@publiccounsel.org
fmalik@publiccounsel.org
Attorneys for Intervenors
COMMUNITY POWER COLLECTIVE
and INNERCITY STRUGGLE

DOUGLAS J. DENNINGTON
PETER J. HOWELL
AMBER LES
ERIK LEGGIO
RUTAN & TUCKER, LLP
18575 Jamboree Road, 9th Floor
Irvine, CA 92612
Telephone: (714) 641-5100
Facsimile: (714) 546-9035
ddennington@rutan.com
phowell@rutan.com
ales@rutan.com
eleggio@rutan.com
Attorneys for Petitioner/Plaintiff
APARTMENT ASSOCIATION OF
GREATER LOS ANGELES COUNTY,
INC. dba APARTMENT ASSOCIATION
OF GREATER LOS ANGELES

CASSIDY BENNETT
JONATHAN JAGER
LEGAL AID FOUNDATION OF LOS
ANGELES
7000 South Broadway
Los Angeles, CA 90003
Telephone: (213) 640-3835
Facsimile: (213) 471-4568
cbennett@lafla.org
jjager@lafla.org
Attorneys for Intervenors
COMMUNITY POWER COLLECTIVE
and INNERCITY STRUGGLE

HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO, City Attorney
MEI-MEI CHENG
ELAINE ZHONG
OFFICE OF THE LOS ANGELES CITY
ATTORNEY
City Hall, 200 North Spring Street, 21st Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Telephone: (213) 922-7715
Facsimile: (213) 978-7957
Elaine.Zhong@lacity.org
Attorneys for Respondent
CITY OF LOS ANGELES (sued as “CITY
OF LOS ANGELES; COUNSEL OF THE
CITY OF LOS ANGELES)